Chapter 9

Corporate Governance
Implications of the Charter Capital
Table of Contents

A. GENERAL PROVISIONS RELATED TO THE CHARTER CAPITAL ...................... 94
   1. The Definition of Charter Capital ........................................................... 94
   2. Minimum Charter Capital ....................................................................... 95
   3. Charter Capital and Authorized Shares ................................................. 95
   4. Full Payment for Shares ........................................................................ 96
   5. Contributions to the Charter Capital ...................................................... 96

B. INCREASING THE CHARTER CAPITAL .............................................................. 98
   1. Methods of Increasing the Charter Capital ........................................... 98
   2. Methods of Placement ........................................................................... 99
   3. Internal Sources for Increasing the Charter Capital .............................. 99
   4. Ownership Rights Protection When Increasing the Charter Capital ...100
   5. Procedural Guarantees for Increasing the Charter Capital .................101

C. PROTECTING THE CHARTER CAPITAL .............................................................. 105
   1. Overview of Decreasing the Charter Capital ...................................... 107
   2. Share Buybacks ................................................................................... 110
   3. Redemption of Shares ......................................................................... 114
   4. Reciprocal Shareholdings .................................................................... 115

D. STATUTORY RESERVES ............................................................................... 116
   1. The Reserve Fund ................................................................................ 116
   2. Other Funds .......................................................................................... 117
   3. Additional Paid-In Capital .................................................................... 118
The Chairman's Checklist

✓ Has the Supervisory Board ensured that the company’s founders have paid their initial contributions and that in-kind contributions have been properly valued?

✓ Does the Supervisory Board understand the financial needs of the company and the different techniques of corporate finance? Is the Supervisory Board authorized to increase the charter capital? Is the Supervisory Board careful not to dilute the ownership of shareholders?

✓ Are capital increases justified?

✓ Does the Supervisory Board ensure that the charter capital and consequently the creditors are adequately protected in cases of charter capital decreases? In such cases, does the Supervisory Board make decisions regarding the buyback of company shares? Has the Supervisory Board ensured that all shareholders who submit their shares are treated equitably?

✓ How does the Supervisory Board ensure that the reserve fund is utilized in the best interests of the company? What other funds has the company established?

The concept of charter capital is still largely embedded in continental European law. The same holds true for Russia. The Company Law in particular attaches certain protective functions to charter capital, protecting shareholders from dilution and providing a minimum guarantee that obligations toward company creditors will be fulfilled. Although the charter capital per se cannot fulfill that role, it is still considered one of the elements guaranteeing the interests of creditors. Regarding shareholders, the charter capital plays an important role since many shareholder rights are directly linked to the size of their investment in the charter capital.

Charter capital has a legal, rather than economic meaning. It only exists in accounting terms, as fixed in the balance sheet. For this reason, its protective function is often criticized as a formality. Regardless, it is a legal requirement when establishing and operating a company. Legislation provides for certain rules
The Russia Corporate Governance Manual

that govern both increases and decreases in the charter capital. In addition, there are other procedural guarantees of shareholder and creditor rights, such as the buyback by the company of its own shares, the redemption of shares, reciprocal shareholdings, and the maintenance of statutory reserves, all of which are discussed in this chapter.

A. General Provisions Related to the Charter Capital

The charter capital is an important element of the legal definition of a joint stock company, which is defined as a commercial entity, whose charter capital is divided into a specified number of shares, certifying the company participants’ (shareholders’) rights in relation to the company.254 The charter capital has important legal implications for:

- Determining the minimum amount of a shareholder’s liability;255
- Determining shareholder rights in relation to their proportionate share in the charter capital; and
- Offering support to protect creditor rights by setting the minimum amount of assets a company must have; this is one of the legal instruments upon which creditors can rely when seeking to ensure that the company will fulfill its contractual obligations.256

1. The Definition of Charter Capital

The charter capital is defined as the par value of the company’s shares that are issued and outstanding.257 Only shares that have been issued comprise the charter capital. This includes treasury shares, i.e. shares repurchased by the company for re-sale or for retirement that are issued but not outstanding. Bonds and other credit instruments are not part of the charter capital.

---

254 Civil Code (CC), Article 96, Clause 1; Law on Joint Stock Companies (LJSC), Article 2, Clause 1, Paragraph 1.
255 LJSC, Article 2, Clause 1, Paragraph 2.
256 LJSC, Article 25, Clause 1, Paragraph 3.
257 LJSC, Article 25, Clause 1.
The total amount of the charter capital cannot exceed a maximum of 25% preferred shares and must contain a minimum of 75% common shares.  

2. Minimum Charter Capital

Legislation requires that every company have minimum charter capital of at least 1,000 times the minimum monthly wage (effective on the date of the company’s state registration). This amount is intended to dissuade smaller undertakings from registering as joint stock companies, and provide start-up capital to newly established companies that cannot be distributed to shareholders.

3. Charter Capital and Authorized Shares

The Company Law provides that the charter may specify the number and nominal value of authorized shares of each type and class, as well as the rights attached to them. Authorized shares are the maximum number of shares of any class that a company may create under the terms of its charter, in addition to already issued shares.

The company is not required to issue all shares it has authorized. If the company chooses not to issue authorized shares, these shares are referred to as authorized but not issued. Only those shares that are issued constitute the charter capital.

A shareholder vote is required to increase the number of authorized shares. In order to avoid costly and time-consuming GMS organization procedures every time the company seeks additional capital, a company may issue some of its authorized but previously un-issued shares by a Supervisory Board decision.

The total authorized capital that a company sets forth in its charter is based upon the amount of money that the company requires at its establishment and the percentage of dilution its founders are willing to accept in the future.

---

258 LJSC, Article 25, Clause 2.
259 LJSC, Article 26; The Law on the Minimum Amount of Payment for Labor, Article 4. Currently, the minimum monthly wage is set at RUR 100.
260 LJSC, Article 27, Clause 1, Paragraph 2.
Best Practices: Good corporate governance practice stipulates that the charter should authorize the Supervisory Board to increase the charter capital by issuing authorized shares. When doing so, the charter should include the following information:

- Maximum number of authorized shares. In general, the maximum amount must not exceed 100% of the charter capital at the moment of the authorization for the Supervisory Board to issue authorized shares;
- Types and classes of authorized shares; and
- Form of payment for additionally issued shares.

4. Full Payment for Shares

Shares issued and placed during the establishment of the company must be paid in full within one year from the moment of the company’s state registration, unless the founders’ contract provides for a shorter period. Full payment should guarantee that shareholders contribute the minimum amount of assets and that the charter capital is duly formed. If shares have not been fully paid upon expiration of a specified period, the unpaid shares must be returned to the company. The founders’ contract may also provide penalties in cases of non-payment or failure to pay in full. At least 50% of the shares placed to the founders at the establishment of the company must be paid within three months after the company’s state registration. The company is prohibited from engaging in any activity, other than those related to the establishment of the company, before receiving payment for 50% of the shares.

5. Contributions to the Charter Capital

The form of payment for shares during the establishment of the company must be specified by the founders’ contract. In general, the shares issued during the estab-

---

261 LJSC, Article 34, Clause 1.
262 LJSC, Article 34, Clause 1, Paragraph 2.
263 LJSC, Article 2, Clause 2, Paragraph 2. This provision is unclear as to whether these shares have to be paid in full and who is responsible for verifying that full payment has been made.
264 LJSC, Article 34, Clause 2.
Chapter 9. Corporate Governance Implications of the Charter Capital

Establishment of the company can be paid with money or contributions in-kind, including shares and securities of other companies, tangible or intangible assets, property rights, and/or other rights that have monetary value.\textsuperscript{265} In-kind contributions are, however, subject to certain rules. The valuation of in-kind contributions must be agreed upon by the founders\textsuperscript{266} and supported by the valuation of an Independent Appraiser. Founders are prohibited from setting the value of assets, property rights, and other rights at a value higher than that determined by an Independent Appraiser.\textsuperscript{267} An Independent Appraiser cannot be a founder, an owner, a shareholder, an employee, a contractor, or any other person affiliated with the company.\textsuperscript{268} Any individual (or a legal entity) needs a license to be an Independent Appraiser. An Independent Appraiser must be insured against civil liability.\textsuperscript{269}

In addition to the valuation of initial in-kind contributions to the charter capital, an independent appraisal is required when the company:

- Redeems shares;\textsuperscript{270}
- Is engaged in a transaction that involves state property;\textsuperscript{271}
- Is engaged in mortgage operations;\textsuperscript{272} or
- Is engaged in the sale of its assets during bankruptcy.

**Best Practices:** A company should use a licensed Independent Appraiser to determine the market value of property,\textsuperscript{273} value debts, and assess liabilities.\textsuperscript{274} An Independent Appraiser can also play an important role in assisting management and shareholders during the company reorganization.

\textsuperscript{265} LJSC, Article 34, Clause 2.
\textsuperscript{266} LJSC, Article 34, Clause 3, Paragraph 1.
\textsuperscript{267} LJSC, Article 34, Clause 3, Paragraph 3.
\textsuperscript{268} Law on Appraisal Activity, Article 16.
\textsuperscript{269} Law on Appraisal Activity, Article 17.
\textsuperscript{270} LJSC, Article 75, Clause 3.
\textsuperscript{271} Law on Appraisal Activity, Article 8.
\textsuperscript{272} Law on Appraisal Activity, Article 8; Law on Mortgage of Property, Article 14, Clause 1.
\textsuperscript{273} LJSC, Article 77, Clause 2, Paragraph 1.
\textsuperscript{274} Law on Appraisal Activity, Article 5.
B. Increasing the Charter Capital

A number of different factors, such as market conditions, reorganizations, and growth, may necessitate an increase of charter capital. There are two methods of increasing the charter capital:

- Utilizing external sources, such as when the company attracts financial resources from existing shareholders or third parties; and
- From internal sources when the company uses its own funds to capitalize its internal reserves.

1. Methods of Increasing the Charter Capital

Methods to increase the charter capital are summarized in Table 1.275

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Issuing additional shares for consideration</th>
<th>Issuing additional shares without consideration</th>
<th>Increasing the nominal value of shares</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contributors</td>
<td>Shareholders and third parties</td>
<td>The company (using funds available from internal sources as defined by legislation)</td>
<td>The company (using funds available from internal sources as defined by legislation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose</td>
<td>To attract additional funding. It will, however, dilute the holdings of existing shareholders if they are unwilling/unable to make use of their pre-emptive rights</td>
<td>To pay stock dividends, increase the company’s equity, etc.</td>
<td>To pay stock dividends, increase the company’s equity, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recipients of new shares</td>
<td>Existing shareholders and third parties</td>
<td>Only existing shareholders</td>
<td>Only existing shareholders</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

275 LJSC, Article 28, Clause 1.
Chapter 9. Corporate Governance Implications of the Charter Capital

Table 1: Increasing the Charter Capital

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method of share issue</th>
<th>Issuing additional shares for consideration</th>
<th>Issuing additional shares without consideration</th>
<th>Increasing the nominal value of shares</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Changing the company’s ownership structure</td>
<td>Possibly</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method of share issue</td>
<td>Issue of additional (authorized) shares</td>
<td>Issue of additional (authorized) shares</td>
<td>Issue of shares with a higher nominal value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method of placement</td>
<td>Subscription (open or closed)</td>
<td>Distribution</td>
<td>Conversion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approving governing body</td>
<td>The General Meeting of Shareholders (GMS), unless delegated by the charter to the Supervisory Board</td>
<td>The GMS, unless delegated by the charter to the Supervisory Board</td>
<td>The GMS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-emptive rights</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Methods of Placement

There are three methods of placing shares:

1) Distribution of shares among shareholders;
2) Conversion, for example when the company increases the charter capital by increasing the nominal value of issued shares; and
3) Subscription, that is when the company floats shares for consideration.

3. Internal Sources for Increasing the Charter Capital

Depending on the method chosen to increase the charter capital, the company can use the funds of shareholders and/or third parties; it can also choose to capitalize using its internal resources. The company may use the following internal resources for capitalization purposes:276

- Additional paid-in capital;
- Special purpose funds of the company that were not used during the previous

---

276 FCSM Regulation No. 03-30/ps on the Standards of Security Issue and Registration of Security Prospectuses (FCSM Regulation No. 03-30/ps), 18 June 2003, Section 4.3.2.
year (the reserve fund and the employees’ fund cannot however be used for this purpose); and
• Retained earnings/undistributed profits.

When increasing the charter capital from internal sources, the amount of the increase cannot exceed the difference between the amount of the net assets, on the one hand, and, on the other, the sum of the charter capital and the reserve fund as of the date the decision to increase the charter capital is approved.\textsuperscript{277}

There are two types of subscription available, as shown in Table 2:\textsuperscript{278}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2: Types of Subscription</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Open</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The offer is made to an unlimited number of subscribers;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The charter or legislation cannot limit the subscription.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Ownership Rights Protection When Increasing the Charter Capital

The company’s ownership structure will likely change if the charter capital is increased from external sources. Issuing additional shares results in the dilution of the ownership rights of existing shareholders. Under certain circumstances, however, existing shareholders may have pre-emptive rights to protect them from dilution.\textsuperscript{279}

\textbf{For a more detailed discussion on pre-emptive rights, see Chapter 7, Section B.5.}

When increasing the charter capital from internal sources, additional shares must be distributed to all owners of shares of each type and class.\textsuperscript{280} In addition, the number of new shares of each type and class that are distributed to each shareholder must be pro rated to the number of shares already held by him.

\textsuperscript{277} LJSC, Article 28, Clause 5, Paragraph 2.
\textsuperscript{278} LJSC, Article 39, Clause 2, Paragraph 1.
\textsuperscript{279} LJSC, Article 40, Clause 1, Paragraphs 1 and 2.
\textsuperscript{280} LJSC, Article 28, Clause 5, Paragraph 3; FCSM Regulation No. 03-30/ps, Section 4.3.4.
Chapter 9. Corporate Governance Implications of the Charter Capital

Consequently, each shareholder who owns fractional shares must receive a proportionate fraction of a full share of the same type and class. However, Russian legislation forbids an increase in the charter capital from internal sources if fractional shares will occur as a result.

5. Procedural Guarantees for Increasing the Charter Capital

Company Law and securities legislation provide detailed procedures that companies must follow in order to increase the charter capital. These procedures are aimed at guaranteeing that shareholder rights are protected. The Federal Commission for the Securities Market (FCSM), by registering share issues, plays an important role in overseeing the legality of the increase, thus enforcing proper corporate governance practices in such cases.

The GMS or the Supervisory Board plays the leading role in increasing the charter capital, depending on the method chosen.

a) The GMS Makes the Decision to Place Shares

The decision to increase the charter capital by increasing the nominal value of issued shares must be approved by the GMS. The GMS also decides to increase the charter capital by issuing additional shares (with or without consideration), unless the charter has delegated this right to the Supervisory Board.

First, if the decision to increase the charter capital by issuing additional shares (with or without consideration) falls within the authority of the GMS, legislation requires that the Supervisory Board place the proposal (or motion) to increase the charter capital on the GMS agenda. Unless the charter provides otherwise, only the Supervisory Board has the right to propose the item for the agenda. A simple majority vote of directors participating in the Supervisory Board meeting must approve the proposal unless the charter or by-laws require a higher percentage of votes.

281 FCSM Regulation No. 03-30/ps, Section 4.3.6.
282 FCSM Regulation No. 03-30/ps, Section 4.3.5.
283 LJSC, Article 28, Clause 2, Paragraph 1.
284 LJSC, Article 28, Clause 2, Paragraph 2.
285 LJSC, Article 49, Clause 3.
Second, the company cannot issue shares unless it has sufficient authorized shares for this purpose.\textsuperscript{287} The GMS can simultaneously take the decision to increase the charter capital and the decision to either amend the charter to provide for the respective number of authorized shares or amend the charter provision concerning the number of authorized shares.\textsuperscript{288} The GMS decision to increase the charter capital is also called the decision to place shares. The different majority votes required for these decisions are summarized in Table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Table 3: Majority Votes Required for the Decision to Increase the Charter Capital</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>3/4-Majority in the Case of:</strong>\textsuperscript{289}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- An issuance of additional common shares representing more than 25% of the total issued common shares through open subscription</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- An issuance of additional preferred shares which can be converted into common shares representing more than 25% of the total issued common shares through open subscription</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Closed subscription</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b) The Supervisory Board Decides to Place Shares

In general, the purpose of authorized shares is to enable the company to attract additional capital in an uncomplicated manner. Procedural requirements for increasing the charter capital by the decision of the GMS are cumbersome, time-consuming, and costly. This may make it harder for the company to attract financing quickly in a rapidly changing business environment. For this very purpose, the Company Law permits companies to empower the Supervisory Board to issue authorized shares (with or without consideration). In this case, a unanimous approval of all serving Supervisory Board members is, however, required.\textsuperscript{291}

\textsuperscript{286} LJSC, Article 68, Clause 3.
\textsuperscript{287} LJSC, Article 27, Clause 1, Paragraph 2.
\textsuperscript{288} LJSC, Article 28, Clause 3, Paragraph 2.
\textsuperscript{289} LJSC, Article 49, Clause 4; Article 39, Clause 4; Article 32, Clause 4, Paragraph 2. The charter may provide for a higher percentage of votes required for a decision.
\textsuperscript{290} LJSC, Article 28, Clause 2; Article 49, Clause 2.
\textsuperscript{291} LJSC, Article 28, Clause 2, Paragraph 3.
Chapter 9. Corporate Governance Implications of the Charter Capital

Best Practices: The Supervisory Board should conduct a meeting where directors are physically present to approve the decision to place shares.\textsuperscript{292}

The Supervisory Board may only approve the decision to place shares if the number of additional shares of each type and class to be issued does not exceed the total number of authorized shares of each type and class as set forth in the charter.\textsuperscript{293}

c) Information that Must Be Included in the Decision to Place Shares

Depending on the method of placement, the decision to place shares must include the information presented in Table 4.\textsuperscript{294}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Required Information</th>
<th>Method of Placement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conversion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The types and classes of shares, the nominal value of which will be increased</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The nominal value of shares of each type and class after the increase</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information that the increase of the charter capital is from retained earnings (if it is so provided)</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The method of placement</td>
<td>✓ ✓ ✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The number of shares of each type and class that will be issued within the limits of authorized shares</td>
<td>✓ ✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{292} Federal Commission for the Securities Market’s Code of Corporate Conduct (FCSM Code), Chapter 3, Section 4.4.

\textsuperscript{293} LJSC, Article 28, Clause 3, Paragraph 1.

\textsuperscript{294} LJSC, Article 28, Clause 4; FCSM Regulation No. 03-30/ps, Sections 4.1.3, 5.1.1, 6.1.1 and 6.1.10.
Table 4: Information that Must Be Included in the Decision to Place Shares

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Required Information</th>
<th>Method of Placement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The price of additional shares, or the procedure to determine the price, of additional shares</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>➔ For more information on the placement price, see Chapter 11, Section C.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The price of additional shares, or the procedure to determine the price, for shareholders who exercise pre-emptive rights</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The form of payment for additionally issued shares (if required)</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The list of persons (names and/or categories of persons such as the company’s employees, shareholders, credit institutions, etc.) to whom the company intends to issue additional shares if the issue takes place through closed subscription</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Depending on the method of placement, the decision to place shares can include optional information, as presented in Table 5.295

Table 5: Optional Information Included in the Decision to Place Shares

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Optional Information</th>
<th>Method of Placement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The date, or the procedure to determine the date, of placement (the dates of the beginning and end of the period of placement)</td>
<td>✓✓✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The sources from which the increase in charter capital will be paid</td>
<td>✓✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

295 FCSM Regulation No. 03-30/ps, Sections 4.1.3, 5.1.1 and 6.1.1.
Chapter 9. Corporate Governance Implications of the Charter Capital

Table 5: Optional Information Included in the Decision to Place Shares

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Optional Information</th>
<th>Method of Placement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conversion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The procedure and the period for making the payment for additional shares</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The procedure for concluding contracts during the placement of additional shares</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The number of additionally issued shares that is necessary for the issue to be recognized as completed, and the procedure for returning payments that have been made for additionally issued shares(^{296})</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{296}\) FCSM Regulation No. 03-30/ps, Section 6.1.11. The volume of additionally issued shares that is necessary for the issue to be recognized as having taken place cannot be less than 75% of the additionally issued shares.

\(^{297}\) FCSM Regulation No. 03-30/ps, Section 6.1.12.

d) Issue of Shares for In-Kind Contributions

If the decision to place shares allows shareholders to pay for additional shares with other securities, or with other assets having monetary value, such a decision must also include the:\(^{297}\)

- List of assets that can be used to pay for shares; and
- Name of the Independent Appraiser(s) who will be used to determine the market value of the assets.

C. Protecting the Charter Capital

One of the purposes of the charter capital is to provide a minimum guarantee that the company will fulfill its obligations toward creditors. However, this function will only exist in theory if it is not linked to preserving a minimum level of company assets. The Company Law provides that the value of a company’s net assets at the end of the second and any subsequent year cannot be lower than the stated
charter capital of the company. Should this occur, the company must decrease its charter capital, but not to a level lower than the minimum amount set forth in legislation. Moreover, the company must liquidate if the value of its net assets at the end of the second year, or any subsequent year thereafter, falls below the minimum amount of the charter capital. This is yet another safeguard for providing protection for creditors. If the company does not make the decision to either decrease the charter capital or liquidate within a reasonable period of time, creditors may request either the early performance, or the early termination of obligations toward them. In both cases, creditors can also request compensation for losses. Finally, state oversight bodies have the right to ask the court to liquidate the company.

There are other actions that may, in one way or another, affect the charter capital and net assets. Such actions and mechanisms, which protect against the distribution of the company’s assets to shareholders or other parties to the detriment of creditors, are listed in Figure 1.

![Figure 1: Protection the Charter Capital](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items:</th>
<th>Buyback by the company of shares issued by the company</th>
<th>Redemtional of shares</th>
<th>Decrease in the charter capital</th>
<th>Reciprocal shareholdings</th>
<th>Distribution of dividends</th>
<th>Maintaining statutory reserves</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Source: IFC, August 2003

---

298 LJSC, Article 35, Clause 4.

299 LJSC, Article 29, Clause 1, Paragraph 4. The company cannot decrease its charter capital below the minimum specified by legislation, which is currently set at RUR 100,000 as of 1 January 2004. The minimum charter capital is determined as of the date of submission of the documents for the state registration of charter amendments related to the decrease of the charter capital. However, when the decrease is required by the Company Law, the minimum charter capital must be determined as of the date of the company’s state registration.

300 LJSC, Article 35, Clause 5.

301 LJSC, Article 35, Clause 6. The Constitutional Court of Russia has recently upheld the legality of these rules (Decision No. 14-P, the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation, 18 July 2003).
Chapter 9. Corporate Governance Implications of the Charter Capital

1. Overview of Decreasing the Charter Capital

A decrease in the company’s charter capital is generally used as a tool to create returns for shareholders without paying dividends. Decreases in charter capital — more specifically, share buybacks — do however have the potential for abuse. A decrease in the charter capital can favor some shareholders at the expense of others. If a decrease in the charter capital involves a share buyback, it is essential to ensure the equitable treatment of all shareholders. This holds particularly true if the company has several classes of shareholders with different rights or holders of other securities. At the same time, a decrease in the charter capital reduces the level of shareholders’ liability and the minimum amount of assets intended to serve as a guarantee that the company will fulfill its obligations toward creditors.

Thus, any decrease in the charter capital can be:

- **Real** when it involves a share buyback from shareholders; or
- **Nominal** when the charter capital is decreased by writing off losses, intended to either reorganize the company’s financial position or create reserves that can be used for future distribution.

a) Methods of Decreasing the Charter Capital

The charter capital can be decreased in three different ways as summarized in Table 6.302

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Decrease</th>
<th>Decrease the Nominal Value of Issued Shares</th>
<th>Retire Treasury Shares</th>
<th>Buyback Outstanding Shares and Retire These</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Legal Stipulation</td>
<td>Mandatory and/or voluntary</td>
<td>Mandatory and/or voluntary</td>
<td>Voluntary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charter Stipulation</td>
<td>Always permitted</td>
<td>Always permitted</td>
<td>Only if permitted by the charter</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

302 LJSC, Article 29, Clause 1, Paragraph 2.
The Russia Corporate Governance Manual

Table 6: Methods of Decreasing the Charter Capital

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Who Can Propose the Decrease</th>
<th>Decrease the Nominal Value of Issued Shares</th>
<th>Retire Treasury Shares</th>
<th>Buyback Outstanding Shares and Retire These</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shareholders or the Supervisory Board</td>
<td>Shareholders or the Supervisory Board</td>
<td>The Supervisory Board, unless the charter provides otherwise</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approving Governing Body</th>
<th>The GMS</th>
<th>The GMS</th>
<th>The GMS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Class by Class Voting</td>
<td>Yes, if the rights of preferred shareholders can be limited as a result of decreasing the charter capital</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of the Decrease</td>
<td>Conversion of shares with a higher nominal value into shares with a lower nominal value</td>
<td>Retiring treasury shares</td>
<td>Purchasing and retiring shares</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b) Mandatory and Voluntary Decreases of the Charter Capital

A decrease in the charter capital is required by legislation, if: 305

- At the end of the second and every subsequent financial year the value of the net assets of the company is less than the charter capital; and
- Treasury shares are not replaced within one year after the company has purchased them.

Decreasing the charter capital by retiring treasury shares is only possible if permitted by the charter. 304

c) Procedures for Decreasing the Charter Capital

Regardless of which method is chosen, the decision to decrease the charter capital must be taken by a simple majority vote of shareholders participating in the GMS. 305

---

303 LJSC, Article 35, Clause 4; Article 34, Clause 1, Paragraph 5; Article 72, Clause 3, Paragraph 2; Article 76, Clause 6, Paragraph 2.
304 LJSC, Article 29, Clause 1, Paragraph 3.
305 LJSC, Article 29, Clause 2; Article 49, Clause 2.
Chapter 9. Corporate Governance Implications of the Charter Capital

The proposal to decrease the charter capital by decreasing the nominal value of issued shares, or by retiring treasury shares, can be placed on the agenda of the GMS either by shareholder proposal or at the initiative of the Supervisory Board. If shares are repurchased for retirement, the right to put this resolution on the agenda of the GMS rests exclusively with the Supervisory Board, unless the charter provides otherwise.\textsuperscript{306}

If the proposal to decrease the charter capital is submitted by the Supervisory Board, a simple majority vote of its members participating in the Supervisory Board meeting is required, unless the charter or by-laws require a higher percentage of votes.\textsuperscript{307}

\begin{quote}
Best Practices: The quorum for the Supervisory Board meeting proposing to decrease the charter capital should be defined as 2/3 of all directors.\textsuperscript{308}
\end{quote}

d) Information Included in the Decision to Place Shares

To decrease the charter capital by reducing the nominal value of issued shares, new shares with a lower nominal value must be issued, and the existing shares have to be converted into these newly issued shares. In this case, the decision to decrease the charter capital is also called the decision to place shares and must include information on:\textsuperscript{309}

- The types and classes of shares, the nominal value of which will be decreased;
- The nominal value of shares for each type and class after the decrease has taken place; and
- The method of placing shares (in this case, the conversion of shares with a higher nominal value into shares with a lower nominal value).

The decision to place shares can also include information on the date, or the procedure to determine such date, when shares must be converted.\textsuperscript{310}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{306} LJSC, Article 49, Clause 3.  \\
\textsuperscript{307} LJSC, Article 68, Clause 3.  \\
\textsuperscript{308} FCSM Code, Chapter 3, Section 4.15.  \\
\textsuperscript{309} FCSM Regulation No. 03-30/ps, Section 5.1.2.  \\
\textsuperscript{310} FCSM Regulation No. 03-30/ps, Section 5.1.2.
\end{flushleft}
e) Decreases in the Charter Capital and Creditor Protection

The decrease of the charter capital typically affects creditor rights since it decreases the minimum amount of the company’s assets serving as a guarantee that the company can meet its obligations toward creditors. The company must then notify creditors in writing of a reduction in the charter capital. It must further publish an announcement in the print media that publishes information on the state registration of legal entities regarding the decrease in its charter capital within 30 days after the decision is taken. This falls under the authority of the General Director who will commonly assign this task to the Corporate Secretary or another person.

The company is required to present evidence to the state registration authority of the timely notification of all creditors regarding the decrease in the charter capital before the respective charter amendments can be registered.

Within 30 days after the submission of the notification to creditors, or after the publication of the announcement, a creditor has the right to demand in writing:

- Early termination of the company’s obligations and the reimbursement of losses caused by early termination; or
- Early fulfillment of obligations by the company and the reimbursement of losses related to early fulfillment.

2. Share Buybacks

Under certain circumstances and conditions, companies have the right to repurchase their own shares. This is called a share buyback. Share buybacks may have a number of corporate governance implications. First, there may be a financial planning concern: since cash is used to purchase shares, fewer funds may be available for further business development. Second, shareholder rights can be abused if the company does not provide equal opportunity to all shareholders to sell their shares back to the company. Third, the company distributes cash directly to selling shareholders and may therefore diminish the company’s ability to service its debts or otherwise meet its obligations to creditors.

311 LJSC, Article 30, Clause 1.
312 LJSC, Article 30, Clause 2.
313 LJSC, Article 30, Clause 1.
Chapter 9. Corporate Governance Implications of the Charter Capital

Certain rules specify how to conduct a share buyback and are summarized in Table 7. They differ depending on whether the buyback is to decrease the charter capital (specific buyback) or for any other reason (general buyback).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Table 7: Types of Buybacks</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Specific</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The shares issued by the company are repurchased and retired to decrease the charter capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The repurchase is carried out by decision of the GMS to decrease the charter capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The share buyback is only permitted if allowed by the charter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shares must be retired upon buyback</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a) **Buyback Procedures**

To repurchase its own shares, a company must follow steps, as summarized in Table 8.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Table 8: Buyback Procedures</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Specific</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initiation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On the basis of the decision to decrease the charter capital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision-making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The GMS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase price</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

314 LJSC, Article 72, Clause 1, Paragraph 1.
315 LJSC, Article 72, Clause 2, Paragraph 1.
316 LJSC, Article 72, Clause 2, Paragraph 2.
The decision to buyback shares issued by the company must be approved by either:317

- A \( \frac{3}{4} \)-supermajority of shareholders participating in the GMS, upon the proposal of the Supervisory Board, unless the charter provides otherwise; or
- A simple majority vote of directors participating in the Supervisory Board meeting, if the charter delegates this authority to the Supervisory Board.

The Supervisory Board must set the purchase price of shares for each type and class, which is always the market value of shares.318

The Supervisory Board must also define the form of payment for the shares. As a rule, a company must pay in cash unless the charter provides otherwise.319

In addition, the Supervisory Board must set the period within which the share buyback must take place. This period cannot be less than 30 days.320

b) Information Included in the Buyback Decision
The decision to buyback shares must include information on:321

- The type and class of shares to be repurchased;
- The number of shares of each type and class;
- The purchase price;
- The form of payment;
- The period for making payments to shareholders; and
- The period within which the buyback will take place.

---

317 LJSC, Article 49, Clause 3; Article 49, Clause 4; Article 68, Clause 3.
318 LJSC, Article 72, Clause 4, Paragraph 2; Article 77.
319 LJSC, Article 72, Clause 4, Paragraph 2.
320 LJSC, Article 72, Clause 4, Paragraph 2.
321 LJSC, Article 72, Clause 4, Paragraph 1.
Chapter 9. Corporate Governance Implications of the Charter Capital

c) Limitations on Share Buybacks

Several limitations are placed on the repurchase of shares as summarized in Table 9.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Company Cannot Repurchase if:</th>
<th>Common Shares\textsuperscript{322}</th>
<th>Preferred Shares\textsuperscript{323}</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The nominal value of the outstanding shares will be reduced to less than 90% of the charter capital after repurchase\textsuperscript{324}</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The charter capital is not fully paid</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The company is bankrupt</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The company would be bankrupt as the result of a buyback</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The company had not redeemed the shares upon the demand of shareholders\textsuperscript{325}</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The value of the company’s net assets is less than the sum of the charter capital, the reserve fund, and the positive difference between the liquidation value of preferred shares of all classes and their nominal value</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The value of the company’s net assets will become less than the sum of the charter capital, the reserve fund, and the positive difference between the liquidation value of preferred shares of all classes and their nominal value specified by the charter as a result of the repurchase by the company of common shares</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The value of the company’s net assets is less than the sum of the charter capital, the reserve fund, and the positive difference between the liquidation value of preferred shares of a specified class, the owners of which have priority in receiving the liquidation value of their shares in relation to the preferred shares of the specified class that must be purchased by the company, and their nominal value</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{322} LJSC, Article 73, Clause 1.
\textsuperscript{323} LJSC, Article 73, Clause 2.
\textsuperscript{324} LJSC, Article 72, Clause 2, Paragraph 2.
\textsuperscript{325} LJSC, Article 73, Clause 3.
Table 9: Limitations on Share Buybacks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Company Cannot Repurchase if:</th>
<th>Common Shares(^{322})</th>
<th>Preferred Shares(^{323})</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The value of the company’s net assets will become less than the sum of the charter capital, the reserve fund, and the positive difference between the liquidation value of preferred shares of a specified class, the owners of which have priority in receiving the liquidation value of their shares in relation to the preferred shares of the specified class that shall be purchased by the company, and their nominal value specified by the charter as the result of the repurchase by the company of preferred shares</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

d) Implementing a Share Buyback

A company must notify shareholders 30 days before the beginning of the period during which a buyback will take place. The shareholder notification must contain the same information as required for the decision on the buyback.\(^{326}\)

Any shareholder who owns shares of the type and class that shall be repurchased by the company has the right to sell shares to the company within the specified period. The company must pay for these shares within the period that has been specified in the decision and communicated to shareholders in the notice.\(^{327}\)

If shareholders offer more shares for sale than the company intends to buy according to the decision on the repurchase, the company must purchase shares from all shareholders in a number that is proportionate to the number of shares that have been offered by shareholders for sale (see Mini-Case 1).\(^{328}\)

3. Redemption of Shares

The redemption of issued shares is another transaction that may affect the charter capital, and consequently, the rights of shareholders and creditors. Shares redeemed by a company are commonly retired so as to reduce the charter capital. During a reorganization, repurchased shares must be retired upon re-

\(^{326}\) LJSC, Article 72, Clause 5.

\(^{327}\) LJSC provides no statutory period for such payment.

\(^{328}\) LJSC, Article 72, Clause 4, Paragraph 3.
Chapter 9. Corporate Governance Implications of the Charter Capital

Mini-Case 1

Charter capital = RUR 300,000 (10,000 common shares with a nominal value of RUR 30 each).

The company has decided to purchase 1,000 of its own shares.

Five shareholders offer to sell 2,000 shares.

The company must purchase shares in proportion to the shares offered by shareholders for sale.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shareholders</th>
<th>Number of shares offered to the company:</th>
<th>Number of shares the company must purchase:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shareholder 1</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shareholder 2</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shareholder 3</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shareholder 4</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shareholder 5</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total:</td>
<td>2,000</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: IFC, March 2004

The Company Law provides for certain procedures to protect the rights of creditors; in particular, a company cannot use more than 10% of its net assets to redeem shares. If shareholders request the redemption of shares with a total value of more than 10% of the company’s net assets, the company must redeem shares from all shareholders pro rata to the number of shares offered for redemption.

For more information on redemption rights, see Chapter 7, Section B.6.

4. Reciprocal Shareholdings

Reciprocal or cross-shareholdings are quite common between different companies and may be set up to establish mutual influence or diversify portfolios. Such shareholding structures between two or more companies often cause governance problems. For example:

- If companies increase their charter capital by means of reciprocal subscriptions to shares, the same initial contribution serves to cause two capital increases;

329 LJSC, Article 76, Clause 6, Paragraph 1.
330 LJSC, Article 76, Clause 5.
The Russia Corporate Governance Manual

- When two companies create a reciprocal shareholding by acquiring issued shares of each other, they are causing, at least partially, an indirect distribution or repayment to shareholders whose shares are purchased; or
- Reciprocal shareholdings can decrease the normal influence of independent directors in both companies, and replace the normal control exercised by the shareholders over directors and officers, with a self-controlling system.

Russian legislation, however, does not provide any specific rules regarding reciprocal shareholdings, unless the relationship of dominance and subordination in groups of companies appears.

→ For more information on groups of companies, see Part V, Chapter 15.

D. Statutory Reserves

Protecting the charter capital to safeguard creditor rights is further extended by the requirement and possibility of creating certain additional reserves. As with the charter capital, such reserves only exist in accounting terms.

1. The Reserve Fund

Every company must have a reserve fund. This fund is used to cover (a portion of) the company’s losses, and covers the costs of redeeming shares and bonds when company profits are insufficient for such payment. A company may also establish other funds and additional paid-in capital. The decision as to whether and when to use the reserve fund and the additional paid-in capital is made by the Supervisory Board.

The amount of the reserve fund must be specified by the charter, and cannot be less than 5% of the charter capital. Its main purpose is to protect creditors by ensuring that part of the company’s assets, in addition to the charter capital, cannot be distributed among shareholders.

The reserve fund must be funded by annual deductions from the company’s net profits. The amount of such annual deductions must be specified in the charter, and cannot be less than 5% of its net profits.

331 LJSC, Article 35, Clause 1, Paragraph 1.
332 LJSC, Article 35, Clause 1, Paragraph 2
Chapter 9. Corporate Governance Implications of the Charter Capital

Only if, and to the extent that the company does not have other resources, the reserve fund may be used to:\(^{333}\)

- Write off/cover losses of the company;
- Redeem bonds; and/or
- Redeem shares from shareholders.

The reserve fund may only be used upon a decision by the Supervisory Board.\(^{334}\) The GMS has no authority in this regard.

2. Other Funds

a) Employees’ Fund

The GMS can establish a special fund from its net profits for company employees.\(^{335}\) The Company Law does not require or define specific requirements for such a fund. Its establishment is therefore optional, and all provisions governing such a fund must be specified in the charter.

This fund can only be used for acquiring shares, provided that such shares are to be transferred to the company’s employees. Accordingly, the Company Law provides for one specific source for replenishing the employees’ fund: if a company has transferred shares purchased by using the employees’ fund to its employees, the funds collected must be re-directed to the employees’ fund.\(^{336}\)

b) Other Funds of a Company

The charter or a decision of the GMS may establish other internal funds, such as for stock option plans or dividend payments. Such internal funds are financed through a deduction from the company’s net profits. An example of such funds is the special fund for the payment of dividends on preferred shares.\(^{337}\) Such funds can only be used upon a decision of the Supervisory Board.\(^{338}\)

\(^{333}\) LJSC, Article 35, Clause 1, Paragraph 3.
\(^{334}\) LJSC, Article 65, Clause 1, Paragraph 3, Section 12.
\(^{335}\) LJSC, Article 35, Clause 2, Paragraph 1.
\(^{336}\) LJSC, Article 35, Clause 2, Paragraph 2.
\(^{337}\) LJSC, Article 42, Clause 2.
\(^{338}\) LJSC, Article 65, Clause 1, Paragraph 3, Section 12.
3. Additional Paid-In Capital

Additional paid-in capital is part of the company’s equity and is typically composed of the following sources:

- Any increase resulting from the re-valuation of non-current assets; and
- The positive difference between the nominal value and the placement value of the company’s shares.

Additional paid-in capital has an accounting meaning only, and there is no actual accumulation of funds. Additional paid-in capital can be used, for example, to:

- Offset the losses as the result of re-valuing non-current assets; and
- Increase the charter capital from internal resources of the company.